

UNACCEPTABLE

FEBRUARY 14, 2012

The Obama administration has offered what it has styled as an "accommodation" for religious institutions in the dispute over the HHS mandate for coverage (without cost sharing) of abortion-inducing drugs, sterilization, and contraception. The administration will now require that <u>all</u> insurance plans cover ("cost free") these same products and services. Once a religiously-affiliated (or believing individual) employer purchases insurance (as it must, by law), the insurance company will then contact the insured employees to advise them that the terms of the policy include coverage for these objectionable things.

This so-called "accommodation" changes nothing of moral substance and fails to remove the assault on religious liberty and the rights of conscience which gave rise to the controversy. It is certainly no compromise. The reason for the original bipartisan uproar was the administration's insistence that religious employers, be they institutions or individuals, provide insurance that covered services they regard as gravely immoral and unjust. Under the new rule, the government still coerces religious institutions and individuals to purchase insurance policies that include the very same services.

It is no answer to respond that the religious employers are not "paying" for this aspect of the insurance coverage. For one thing, it is unrealistic to suggest that insurance companies will not pass the costs of these additional services on to the purchasers. More importantly, abortion-drugs, sterilizations, and contraceptives are a necessary feature of the policy purchased by the religious institution or believing individual. They will only be made available to those who are insured under such policy, *by virtue of the terms of the policy*.

It is morally obtuse for the administration to suggest (as it does) that this is a meaningful accommodation of religious liberty because the insurance company will be the one to inform the employee that she is entitled to the embryo-destroying "five day after pill" pursuant to the insurance contract purchased by the religious employer. It does not matter *who* explains the terms of the policy purchased by the religiously affiliated or observant employer. What matters is what services the policy covers.

The simple fact is that the Obama administration is compelling religious people and institutions who are employers to purchase a health insurance contract that provides abortion-inducing drugs, contraception, and sterilization. This is a grave violation of religious freedom and cannot stand. It is an insult to the intelligence of Catholics, Protestants, Eastern Orthodox Christians, Jews, Muslims, and other people of faith and conscience to imagine that they will accept an assault on their religious liberty if only it is covered up by a cheap accounting trick.

Finally, it bears noting that by sustaining the original narrow exemptions for churches, auxiliaries, and religious orders, the administration has effectively admitted that the new policy

(like the old one) amounts to a grave infringement on religious liberty. The administration still fails to understand that institutions that employ and serve others of different or no faith are still engaged in a religious mission and, as such, enjoy the protections of the First Amendment.

Signed:

John Garvey President, The Catholic University of America

Mary Ann Glendon Learned Hand Professor of Law, Harvard University

Robert P. George McCormick Professor of Jurisprudence, Princeton University

O. Carter Snead Professor of Law, University of Notre Dame

Yuval Levin Hertog Fellow, Ethics and Public Policy Center

Religious Leaders

Archbishop Joseph E. Kurtz, D.D. Archbishop of Louisville

Archbishop Charles J. Chaput, OFM Archbishop of Philadelphia

Chuck Colson Founder, Prison Fellowship Ministries

Dr. Paige Patterson Former President, Southern Baptist Convention President, Southwestern Baptist Theological Seminary

Reverend Frederick R. Parke Pastor, Assumption Catholic Church

[Note: Affiliations provided for identification purposes only]

University and College Professors

Jean Bethke Elshtain Laura Spelman Rockefeller Professor of Social and Political Ethics in the Divinity School, Department of Political Science and the Committee on International Relations, The University of Chicago Michael W. McConnell Richard and Frances Mallery Professor of Law & Director, Stanford Constitutional Law Center, Stanford University

Rabbi David Novak J. Richard and Dorothy Shiff Chair in Jewish Studies Professor of Religion and Philosophy University of Toronto President, Union for Traditional Judaism

Donald Landry, Samuel Bard Professor of Medicine & Chair, Department of Medicine & Physician-in-Chief, Columbia University

Thomas F. Farr Director of the Religious Freedom Project, Georgetown University

Margaret F. Brinig Fritz Duda Family Chair in Law Notre Dame Law School

Daniel Costello Bettex Chair Professor Emeritus College of Engineering, University of Notre Dame

Ann W. Astell Professor of Theology, University of Notre Dame

Tom Pratt Dept of EE, College of Engineering University of Notre Dame

David W. Fagerberg Associate Professor Department of Theology University of Notre Dame

Peter M. Kogge Ted McCourtney Prof. of Computer Science & Engineering Concurrent Professor of Electrical Engineering, Univ. of Notre Dame

Michael J. Crowe Cavanaugh Professor Emeritus Program of Liberal Studies University of Notre Dame

Msgr Michael Heintz, PhD Director, Master of Divinity Program Department of Theology University of Notre Dame John Uhran Emeritus prof, Computer Science and Engineering University of Notre Dame

Thomas A. Gresik Department of Economics University of Notre Dame

W. David Solomon Associate Professor of Philosophy University of Notre Dame

Dr. Kirk Doran Assistant Professor of Economics University of Notre Dame

Tonia Hap Murphy Mendoza Pre-Law Advisor Associate Teaching Professor University of Notre Dame

Jim A Seida Viola D. Hank Associate Professor of Accountancy Mendoza College of Business University of Notre Dame

Jeffrey J. Burks Assistant Professor of Accountancy University of Notre Dame

Adrian J. Reimers Adjunct Assistant Professor University of Notre Dame

David S. Younger Assistant Director Italian, Classics, German, and Russian Programs Office of International Studies University of Notre Dame

Kelley M. Shrock Operations Specialist University of Notre Dame Investment Office

Bartley Burk Social Sciences/Hispanic Cataloger Hesburgh Libraries, University of Notre Dame

Judy Hutchinson Assistant Director Office of International Studies University of Notre Dame

Craig Tiller, RA, LEED®AP Senior Director, Project Management Facilities Design and Operations University of Notre Dame

Joseph A. Reimers Technology Support Assistant III University of Notre Dame Kresge Law Library

Michael A. Zenk Director, Post Award Financial Management Office of Research University of Notre Dame

Patrick Griffin Department Chair and Madden-Hennebry Professor of History, University of Notre Dame

Mary K. Daly Program Coordinator, University Life Initiatives Institute for Church Life, University of Notre Dame

Richard W. Garnett Associate Dean and Professor of Law, University of Notre Dame

John Cavadini Director, Institute for Church Life and Associate Professor of Theology, University of Notre Dame

Christian Smith William R. Kenan Professor of Sociology & Director, Center for the Study of Religion and Society, University of Notre Dame

Gary Anderson Hesburgh Professor of Theology, University of Notre Dame

Harindra Joseph F. Fernando Wayne and Diana Murdy Endowed Professor of Engineering and Geosciences, University of Notre Dame

William N. Evans Keough-Hesburgh Professor of Economics, University of Notre Dame

Alfred J. Freddoso John and Jean Oesterle Professor of Thomistic Studies Concurrent Professor of Law Philosophy Department, University of Notre Dame M Katherine Tillman Professor Emerita, Program of Liberal Studies, University of Notre Dame

Walter Nicgorski Professor, Program of Liberal Studies, University of Notre Dame Philip Bess Director of Graduate Studies and Professor of Architecture, University of Notre Dame

Paolo Carozza Professor of Law and Director, Center for Civil and Human Rights, University of Notre Dame

John F. Gaski Associate Professor of Marketing, University of Notre Dame

Duncan G. Stroik Associate Professor of Architecture, University of Notre Dame

Rev. Wilson D. Miscamble, C.S.C. Professor of History, University of Notre Dame

Kenneth Garcia, Ph.D. Associate Director, Institute for Scholarship in the Liberal Arts, University of Notre Dame Gerard V. Bradley Professor of Law, University of Notre Dame

Amy Barrett Professor of Law, University of Notre Dame Sean Kelsey Director of Graduate Studies and Associate Professor of Philosophy, University of Notre Dame

Gabriel Said Reynolds Tisch Family Associate Professor of Islamic Studies and Theology and Director of Undergraduate Studies, University of Notre Dame

William K. Kelley Associate Professor of Law, University of Notre Dame

David O'Connor Associate Professor of Philosophy and Concurrent Associate Professor of Classics, University of Notre Dame

Joseph Kaboski David F. and Erin M. Seng Associate Professor of Economics, University of Notre Dame

Vincent Phillip Muñoz Tocqueville Associate Professor of Political Science Concurrent Associate Professor of Law Department of Political Science, University of Notre Dame

John O'Callaghan

Director, Jacques Maritain Center & Associate Professor of Philosophy, University of Notre Dame

Daniel Philpott Associate Professor of Political Science, University of Notre Dame

Mary M . Keys Associate Professor of Political Science, University of Notre Dame

Eric Sims Assistant Professor of Economics, University of Notre Dame

Mike Pries Associate Professor of Economics, University of Notre Dame Edward Maginn Professor of Chemical and Biomolecular Engineering Associate Dean for Academic Programs, The Graduate School University of Notre Dame

Stephen F. Smith Professor of Law University of Notre Dame

Phillip R. Sloan Professor Emeritus, Program of Liberal Studies and Graduate Program in History and Philosophy of Science, University of Notre Dame

Richard A. Lamanna Emeritus Professor of Sociology University of Notre Dame

Fr. Ronald M. Vierling Rector, Morrissey Manor University of Notre Dame

Rev. William R. Dailey, CSC Visiting Associate Professor Notre Dame Law School

Thomas A. Stapleford Associate Professor, Program of Liberal Studies University of Notre Dame

Thomas P. Flint Professor of Philosophy University of Notre Dame

John B. Londregan Professor of Politics and Public Affairs, Princeton University Patrick McKinley Brennan John F. Scarpa Chair in Catholic Legal Studies and Professor of Law, Villanova University

Mark C. Murphy McDevitt Professor of Religious Philosophy, Georgetown University

Steven Smith Class of 1975 Endowed Professor of Law, University of San Diego

Larry Alexander Warren Distinguished Professor of Law, University of San Diego

David A. Skeel S. Samuel Arsht Professor of Corporate Law, University of Pennsylvania

W. Cole Durham, Jr. Susa Young Gates University Professor of Law and Director, International Center for Law and Religion Studies J. Reuben Clark Law School, Brigham Young University

Lynn D. Wardle Bruce C. Hafen Professor of Law, Brigham Young University Law School

Randy Beck Justice Thomas O. Marshall Chair of Constitutional Law, University of Georgia School of Law

Prof. Alan Mittleman Professor of Modern Jewish Thought The Jewish Theological Seminary

Rabbi Meir Y. Soloveichik Director, Straus Center for Torah and Western Thought, Yeshiva University

Gilbert Meilaender Duesenberg Professor in Christian Ethics, Valparaiso University

Russell D. Moore, Ph.D. Dean and Professor of Christian Theology and Ethics, The Southern Baptist Theological Seminary

J. Budziszewski Professor of Government and Philosophy, University of Texas at Austin

Peter A. Lawler Dana Professor of Government, Berry College

Thomas Kelly Associate Professor of Philosophy, Princeton University

Michael Stokes Paulsen

Distinguished University Chair & Professor of Law, The University of St. Thomas

David Lyle Jeffrey Distinguished Professor of Literature and the Humanities, Baylor University

Hadley P. Arkes Edward N. Ney Professor of Jurisprudence and American Institutions, Amherst College

Salvatore Torquato Professor of Chemistry, Princeton University

Edward R. Dougherty Robert M. Kennedy '26 Chair Director, Genomic Signal Processing Laboratory Department of Electrical and Computer Engineering, Texas A&M University Director, Computational Biology Division Translational Genomics Research Institute, Phoenix, AZ

Ann Hartle Professor of Philosophy, Emory University

Fr Joseph Koterski SJ President, Fellowship of Catholic Scholars & Dept of Philosophy, Fordham University

Timothy S. Fuerst Professor of Economics, Bowling Green State University

Patrick Deneen Tsakopoulos-Kounalakis Associate Professor Director, The Tocqueville Forum on the Roots of American Democracy Department of Government, Georgetown University

Thomas A. Smith Professor of Law, University of San Diego

Michael A. Scaperlanda Edwards Family Chair in Law, University of Oklahoma College of Law

Maria E. Garlock Associate Professor of Civil and Environmental Engineering & Director, Program in Architecture and Engineering, Princeton University

Mark Regnerus Associate Professor of Sociology, University of Texas at Austin

Bryan T. McGraw Assistant Professor of Politics and International Relations, Wheaton College

Timothy Samuel Shah Associate Director & Scholar in Residence, Religious Freedom Project, Berkley Center for Religion, Peace & World Affairs, and Visiting Assistant Professor, Department of Government, Georgetown University

Jacqueline M. Nolan-Haley Professor of Law and Director, ADR & Conflict Resolution Program, Fordham University

David K. DeWolf Professor of Law, Gonzaga University

David B. Kopel Research Director, Independence Institute Adjunct Professor of Advanced Constitutional Law, Denver University, Sturm College of Law

Rev. Thomas V. Berg Professor of Moral Theology, St. Joseph's Seminary-Dunwoodie

William S. Brewbaker III Associate Dean and William Alfred Rose Professor of Law, University of Alabama

John W. Carlson, Ph.D. Professor of Philosophy, Creighton University

Rev. Robert John Araujo, S.J. John Courtney Murray, SJ University Professor of Law, Loyola University of Chicago

John Breen Professor of Law, Loyola University Chicago

Robert Miller Professor of Law, Villanova University

William B. Hurlbut, M.D. Consulting Professor, Dept of Neurobiology, Stanford University Medical Center

Elizabeth Komives Dept of Chemistry and Biochemistry, UC San Diego

John Finley, PhD Tutor, Thomas Aquinas College

Micah J. Watson Director, Center for Politics and Religion and Assistant Professor of Political Science, Union University

John Potts Professor Emeritus of Law, Valparaiso University

Dr. Sean Collins Thomas Aquinas College Michael M. Uhlmann Professor of Politics and Policy, Claremont Graduate University

Helen Alvaré Associate Professor of Law, George Mason University

Michael Moreland, Associate Professor of Law, Villanova University

V. Bradley Lewis Associate Professor of Philosophy, The Catholic University of America

Maria Sophia Aguirre Professor of Economics, The Catholic University of America

Jody Vaccaro Lewis, Assistant Professor of Sacred Scripture, Pontifical Faculty of the Immaculate Conception at the Dominican House of Studies

Mark Rienzi Senior Counsel, the Becket Fund for Religious Liberty Assistant Professor of Law, the Catholic University of America

Patrick Lee Professor of Philosophy, Franciscan University of Steubenville

Francis J. Beckwith Professor of Philosophy and Church-State Studies, Baylor University

William Imboden Assistant Professor, Lyndon B. Johnson School of Public Affairs, University of Texas

Christopher Tollefsen Professor of Philosophy, University of South Carolina

Thomas A. Cavanaugh Professor of Philosophy, University of San Francisco

James F. Hitchcock, Professor of History, St. Louis University

C. Ben Mitchell, PhD Graves Professor of Moral Philosophy, Union University

Christopher Wolfe Co-Director, Thomas International Center & Emeritus Professor, Marquette University

Christopher J. Eberle, Associate Professor of Philosophy, United States Naval Academy Gerald R. McDermott Jordan-Trexler Professor of Religion, Roanoke College

Robert D. Benne Director of the Center for Religion and Society, Roanoke College

Douglas Henry Associate Professor of Philosophy, Baylor University

Scott H. Moore Associate Professor of Philosophy and Great Texts, Baylor University

Kevin E. Miller, PhD Assistant Professor of Theology, Franciscan University of Steubenville

Gregory Schaller Asst. Professor of Politics, Colorado Christian University

Richard Stith Professor of Law, Valparaiso University

Thomas S. Kidd Associate Professor of History and Senior Fellow, Institute of Religion, Baylor University

Joseph Knippenberg Professor of Politics, Oglethorpe University

Gary D. Glenn Distinguished Teaching Professor Emeritus Northern Illinois University

Prof Janet E. Smith Father Michael J. McGivney Chair of Life Ethics Sacred Heart Major Seminary

Carson Holloway Associate Professor of Political Science, University of Nebraska at Omaha

John D. Woodbridge Research Professor of Church History and Christian Thought, Trinity Evangelical Divinity School

Rev Prof D. A. Carson Research Professor of New Testament, Trinity Evangelical Divinity School President, The Gospel Coalition

Kevin Roberts President & Headmaster, John Paul the Great Academy President, John Paul II Institute for the New Evangelization Gareth N. Genner President, Holy Spirit College & Preparatory School

Christopher Wolfe Co-Director, Thomas International Center, and Emeritus Professor Marquette University

Daniel Bonevac Professor of Philosophy University of Texas at Austin

Richard R. Jesse, Ph.D. Associate Professor Emeritus of Business Administration, The University of Vermont

Leroy Huizenga Director of the Christian Leadership Center and Assistant Professor of Theology University of Mary—North Dakota

Jonathan J. Sanford, Ph.D. Professor and Chair Philosophy Department Franciscan University of Steubenville

Msgr. Robert Sokolowski Elizabeth Breckenridge Caldwell Professor of Philosophy The Catholic University of America

Gerald H. Maring Professor Emeritus Washington State University—Pullman

Will Morrisey Hillsdale College Hillsdale, Michigan

Dr. Chris Decaen Thomas Aquinas College (CA)

Dr. Mickey Craig William & Berniece Grewcock Professor of Politics Hillsdale College

John Schwenkler Dept. of Philosophy, Mount St. Mary's University (MD)

Ronald J. Pestritto Graduate Dean and Associate Professor of Politics, Hillsdale College

George H. Guthrie, Ph.D. Benjamin W. Perry Professor of Bible Union University

John Gueguen Politics and Government, Emeritus Illinois State University

Professor John J. Kircher Marquette University Law School

Dr. R. Glen Coughlin Thomas Aquinas College (CA)

Grant S. Nelson William H. Rehnquist Professor of Law Pepperdine University

Bradley C. S. Watson Philip M. McKenna Chair in American and Western Political Thought Co-Director Center for Political and Economic Thought Saint Vincent College

Wilfred M. McClay, SunTrust Chair of Excellence in Humanities University of Tennessee at Chattanooga

Gerard Wegemer Professor of Literature Director, Center for Thomas More Studies University of Dallas

Michael Augros, Ph. D. Thomas Aquinas College (CA)

John Grant, Ph.D. Assistant Professor of Politics Hillsdale College

Robert Eden Professor of Politics Hillsdale College

Robert J. Phillips Associate Professor of Political Science Wheeling Jesuit University

Martijn Cremers Associate Professor of Finance Yale School of Management

Scott Fitzgibbon

Boston College Law School

Marc DiGirolami St. John's University School of Law

Philip D. Mitchell Professor of Social Sciences, Colorado Christian University

Paul Cuff Assistant Professor, Department of Electrical Engineering, Princeton University

University/College/Seminary Presidents, Deans, and Board Members

Stephen D. Minnis President, Benedictine College

Robert Bryan Sloan Jr President, Houston Baptist University

Sister Mary Sarah Galbraith, O.P. President, Aquinas College (TN)

R. Albert Mohler, Jr. President, The Southern Baptist Theological Seminary

Daniel Akin President, Southeastern Baptist Theological Seminary

Timothy O'Donnell President, Christendom College

David Dockery President, Union University

Dr. William K. Thierfelder President, Belmont Abbey College

Dr. David Whitlock President, Oklahoma Baptist University

Carl E. Zylstra President, Dordt College

Michael F. McLean President, Thomas Aquinas College (CA)

Samuel W. "Dub" Oliver, Ph.D. President, East Texas Baptist University

H. James Towey President, Ave Maria University

Bernard F. O'Connor President, DeSales Unviersity

Father Terence Henry, TOR President, Franciscan University of Steubenville

William Edmund Fahey President, The Thomas More College of Liberal Arts (NH) Marianne Evans Mount President, Catholic Distance University

Brian Kelly Dean, Thomas Aquinas College (CA)

John C. McCarthy Dean, School of Philosophy, The Catholic University of America

Thomas Hibbs Honors College Dean and Distinguished Professor of Ethics and Culture, Baylor University

Joshua P. Hochschild Dean of the College of Liberal Arts, Mount St. Mary's University

Donna Bethell Chairman of the Board, Christendom College

Steven R. Cain Assistant Dean For Student Affairs Thomas Aquinas College

Len Munsil, B.S., J.D. President, Arizona Christian University

Dr. Robert Ivany President, University of St Thomas

George E. Garvey Associate Dean for Academic Affairs Professor of Law The Catholic University of America

Mike E. O'Neal President, Oklahoma Christian University

Timothy George Dean, Beeson Divinity School of Samford University

Christopher O. Blum Fellow and Dean Thomas More College (NH)

Paul O'Reilly Vice President for Development Thomas Aquinas College

Kimberly C. Shankman Dean of the College Benedictine College

Angela M. Pfister, J.D. Associate Director, Notre Dame Center for Ethics and Culture

Journalists

R.R. Reno Editor, *First Things*

Ryan Anderson Editor, *Public Discourse*

Asma Uddin International Legal Fellow, The Becket Fund for Religious Liberty Editor-in-Chief, AltMuslimah

Ashley E. McGuire Richard John Neuhaus Fellow, The Becket Fund for Religious Liberty Editor-in-Chief, AltCatholicah Robert Novak Journalism Fellow, The Phillips Foundation

Kathryn Jean Lopez Editor at Large, *National Review Online*

Ramesh Ponnuru Senior Editor, *National Review*

Matthew Schmitz Deputy Editor, *First Things*

Justin Taylor Blogger, "Between Two Worlds," The Gospel Coalition

Thomas Peters Blogger, "American Papist", CatholicVote.org

Independent Scholars, Lawyers, and Think Tanks

Nancy Matthews Former Chancellor of the Roman Catholic Diocese of Bridgeport

George Weigel Distinguished Senior Fellow and William E. Simon Chair in Catholic Studies, Ethics and Public Policy Center

William J. Bennett Host of Morning in America and Washington Fellow, Claremont Institute

Edward Whelan President, Ethics and Public Policy Center

Michael Novak George Frederick Jewett Scholar Emeritus in Religion, Philosophy and Public Policy, American Enterprise Institute Board member, Ave Maria University

Michael Cromartie Evangelicals and Civic Life Program Ethics and Public Policy Center

Brian W. Walsh, Executive Director, American Religious Freedom Program Ethics and Public Policy Center

Father Shenan J. Boquet President, Human Life International

Patrick Fagan Senior Fellow and Director, Marriage & Religion Research Institute

Austin Ruse President, C-FAM

Father Jonathan Morris Author, Televison Analyst Basilica of St. Patrick's Old Cathedral, NYC

Maggie Gallagher Institute for Marriage and Public Policy

Scott Klusendorf, President, Life Training Institute

Robert C. Odle, Jr. Partner, Weil Gotshal and Manges William Saunders Senior Vice President and Senior Counsel Americans United for Life

Charmaine Yoest President, Americans United for Life

Edward R. Grant Vice-Chairman, Americans United for Life Affiliated Scholar, Center for Clinical Bioethics, Georgetown University School of Medicine

Nikolas T. Nikas President and General Counsel Bioethics Defense Fund

Dorinda C. Bordlee VP, Chief Counsel Bioethics Defense Fund

Grace-Marie Turner President, Galen Institute

Helen Hull Hitchcock President, Women for Faith & Family

Elizabeth Kirk University of Notre Dame Fund to Protect Human Life

Pia de Solenni, SThD Diotima Consulting, LLC

Matthew J. Franck Director, William E. and Carol G. Simon Center on Religion and the Constitution The Witherspoon Institute

Kristina Arriaga Executive Director, The Becket Fund for Religious Liberty

Jennifer Roback Morse, Ph.D. Founding President, The Ruth Institute

John F. Brehany, Ph.D. Executive Director and Ethicist Catholic Medical Association

Jennifer Bryson Director, Islam and Civil Society Project The Witherspoon Institute Ed Feulner President The Heritage Foundation

Andrew T. Seeley, PhD Executive Director Institute for Catholic Liberal Education

James M. Kushiner Executive Editor, Touchstone Executive Director, The Fellowship of St. James

Paige C. Cunningham, JD Executive Director The Center for Bioethics & Human Dignity

E. Calvin Beisner, Ph.D. Founder and National Spokesman, Cornwall Alliance for the Stewardship of Creation

Randy Hicks President and CEO, Georgia Family Council

Eric Cochling Vice President of Public Policy, Georgia Family Council

Stuart W. Nolan, Jr., Esq. LegalWorks Apostolate, PLLC